

COMPLIANCE-GAINING MESSAGE PRODUCTION
AND
PHARMACY PRACTICE

Bruce Lambert
Dept. of Speech Communication
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

5/9/91

Overview

- I. The scope of health communication research
- II. Patient compliance and compliance-gaining message production (CGMP)
- III. Strategy selection models of CGMP
- IV. Message design logic models of CGMP
- V. Compliance-gaining in pharmacy practice
- VI. Summary

I. Health communication is a complex, interdisciplinary, and growing area.

A. Many contexts

1. Home
2. Work
3. Gov't.
4. Clinic

B. Many concerns

1. Practical/clinical
2. Political
3. Theoretical
4. Physical/Mental/Spiritual

C. Many relationships

1. Provider/patient
2. Provider/provider
3. Patient/patient, etc.

- II. An interest in compliance is what links my research to health care concerns.
- A. Among health care professionals, high rates of patient non-compliance are clearly a concern (20-80% according to DiMatteo & DiNicola, 1984).
 - B. In communication research, so-called compliance-gaining message production has been an active research area for 25+ years.
 - C. So the question is: "What can we learn from communication research that will help us train providers and thereby increase patient compliance?"

III. Strategy selection models of CGMP

- A. One influential body of work is based on the strategy selection or strategy repertoire model of message production (Dillard, 1990; Marwell & Schmitt, 1967a, b; Miller, Boster, Roloff, & Seibold, 1977; Seibold, Cantrill, & Meyers, 1985).
 - 1. Each person has a repertoire of compliance gaining strategies.
 - 2. Message production is a matter of choosing the right strategy for the situation.
- B. M&S discussed strategies for rewarding, punishing, expertise, activating personal commitments, etc.
- C. Primary method has been hypothetical scenarios plus strategy checklists.
- D. Primary goals have been to categorize strategies and to explain the causes and effects of strategy choice.
- E. Validity of strategy checklist method throws results into doubt.

GROUP LEADER PROBLEM

Imagine that you have been assigned to a group project in one of your classes. The class is in your field of concentration (major) and it is important to you to get a good grade in this class. Your final grade will depend to a great extent on how well the group project turns out. You were assigned to your group by the instructor, who also designated you to be the leader of your group. Each person will receive two grades for the project: an overall grade to the group based on the overall quality of the project report and an individual grade based on each person's contribution to the group effort. Your duties as group leader will include telling the instructor what grade you think each individual in the group deserves based on their individual contributions.

One group member (whose name is Ron) has been causing some problems. Ron seldom makes it to group meetings on time and entirely skipped one meeting without even calling anyone in advance to let the group know. When Ron missed that meeting, two of the group members wanted you to have the instructor remove Ron from your group, although another member persuaded the group to give him another chance. At the next meeting Ron arrived late but apologized for missing the previous meeting and mentioned something about family problems. Ron did volunteer to do all the background research on one important aspect of the group's topic, saying he had a special interest in that part of the project.

The group project is due next week. The group planned to put together the final draft of its report at a meeting scheduled for tomorrow afternoon. Ron calls you up today and says he doesn't have his library research done and can't get it finished before the meeting. He says he just needs more time.

Expressive Designs

- (1) You stupid [JERK]. Why did you wait so long to tell us you were getting behind on your part. You [MESSED] up all of our grades. You're gone. I'm getting you out of this group. Everybody else feels the same way. I hope you have fun when you take the class next semester.
- (2) You [JERK]. I knew you wouldn't do it. (I would slam the phone down and flip him off.)
- (3) Ron, I can't believe you haven't finished your research. You have been inconsiderate to the group all along. Several members even suggested that you be taken out of the group but we decided to give you a chance. Now what are we supposed to do? It was your responsibility to us and you backed out. I'm afraid that I'm going to tell the TA that you haven't done your share. I will be so mad at you if we get a bad grade on this—I need an A in this course.
- (4) Ron, I am going to have to suggest to Professor X that you receive a D or E on your individual part of the presentation. Not only did you come late to the meetings but you completely skipped 1 and now not finishing the part of the project you volunteered to do shows how immature and irresponsible you really are. Do you think you can bring me what you have done and I'll see if the rest of us can finish it.

Conventional Message Designs

- (5) Ron, you haven't been to cooperative or helpful to the group and a few members of the group are getting pissed. Your research is very important to the group and not only you but everyone else will hurt. So you have to get the research done. I can come and help out but if you can't get it done we will have to ask to remove you from the group.
- (6) Ron, get what information you can and bring it to the group meeting and do the rest the day after tomorrow. Maybe the information you might have will be enough, but you better be at our group meeting tomorrow, understand!
- (7) Well, Ron, I'm sorry you don't have your part of the project done. We have given you several breaks thus far and I don't see how we can give you any more. The whole group is depending on you so I would suggest to you to get it done or at the most bring in what you have got done. If you don't get this done I'm going to have to give you a F for the project. If you can't hold up your responsibility with this group even under these adverse conditions (family problems) how are you going to make it in life.
- (8) I would say to Ron that he is holding up the group's project and that he is being very inconsiderate and unreliable. I would also tell him that this class may not be important to him, but it is important to others in the group and if he didn't get his act together, he would be kicked out of our group. I would tell him that we've already given him numerous chances, but he still continues to let us down. We counted on him doing his part of the research so we could put the whole thing together. I would also tell him that I sympathize with his family problems, but if he can't handle his work load, he should've let us know so others could take up his slack. Or maybe he should've told the instructor.

Rhetorical Message Designs

- (9) Ron, is there a problem? If you knew you wouldn't be able to do the work, why did you volunteer for it. We were depending on you to do this work. The rest of the group has done their work and the project is due next week. Is there anyway you can get away now and we can go work on it together and try to finish by tomorrow. We really need to get this and the information is too much for me to by myself or you to do by yourself in this amount of time.
- (10) Ron, I'm sorry you won't have everything ready by tonight. Can you give me some good reasons I can tell the group? I know you've been having problems all along and that's obvious to the rest of the group too. You need to be able to see how your personal problems have interfered in the group's completion of the project. I'll be the first to sympathize with you but now we'll have to come up with some concrete solutions. You can't expect someone to take over your research workload.
- (11) Ron you have to get it done. We can't finish the project until your part of it is done. How much is left to do? What have you gotten done? Have you outlined or have you any idea of the format or info for the part that isn't done? Well, do that tonight before the meeting and we'll finish it that way. Make sure the outline is clear so the others won't have to do more work than necessary.
- (12) Well, Ron, it's due next week and we have to get it all to the typist. OK, if it's not done it's not. Tell you what. Why don't you jot down your main ideas so that we can include them in the introduction and conclusion. Also, tell me when you think your section should come in the whole project. Then get it to my apt. by 10:00 the next day because I have to get it to the typist by 2:00. Is this okay? I'll just explain to the group that you'll have it done but not by meeting time. We all want a good grade, so if you need the time to make your part better, go ahead. But if I can't get it to the typist in time, you'll have to type it. Alright, take it easy.

Figure 1. Characteristic Content and Function of the Three Message Design Logics

CHARACTERISTIC	MESSAGE DESIGN LOGIC		
	EXPRESSIVE	CONVENTIONAL	RHETORICAL
Fundamental Premise	language is a medium for expressing thoughts and feelings	communication is a game played cooperatively by social rules	communication is the creation and negotiation of social selves and situations
Central Dimensions of Communicative Evaluation	clarity of expression openness and honesty unimpeded signalling	appropriateness control of resources cooperativeness	flexibility symbolic sophistication depth of interpretation
Key Message Function	self-expression	secure desired response	negotiate social consensus
Temporal Organization	reaction to prior event	response specified by present context	initiate movement toward desired context
Message/Context Relation	little attention to context	action and meaning context-determined	communication process creates context
Internal Message Coherence	subjective and associative	intersubjective and rule-focussed	intersubjective and style-centered
Diagnostic Message Elements	pragmatically pointless content	mentions of role- and communication-based rights and obligations	explicit context defining clauses and phrases
Method of Managing Face Wants	editing	politeness forms	context redefinition

IV. Message design logic models of CGMP (O'Keefe, 1988)

- A. More ecologically valid methods.
 - 1. Open ended tasks
 - 2. Functional message analysis

- B. Examples of functionally significant variation in messages

- C. The idea of message design logic
 - 1. Expressive
 - 2. Conventional
 - 3. Rhetorical

- D. Evidence of differential effects
 - 1. O'Keefe & Shephard (1989)
 - 2. O'Keefe, Lambert, & Lambert (1991)

V. CGMP in pharmacy practice

- A. Cognitive services and the pharmacist as counselor
- B. Isolate relevant functional encounters and strategic tasks and goals.
 - 1. Gaining compliance and persuading
 - 2. Gathering information
 - 3. Negotiating treatment decisions
 - 4. Monitoring compliance
 - 5. Comforting
- C. Create hypothetical scenarios (see Willinghamz, 1988)
- D. Gather and analyze data.
- E. Interaction or conversation analysis is another powerful empirical method for addressing these questions.
 - 1. Beckman & Frankel
 - 2. Example transcripts

VI. Summary

- A. Health care professionals and communication researchers share a concern with compliance-gaining behavior.

- B. Research on CGMP has many potential applications to pharmacy practice.
 - 1. Teaching
 - 2. Skills training (role plays and videotaping)
 - 3. Assessment
 - 4. Theory building